# NORTHVILLE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

#### June 18, 2014

## Wednesday 7:00 P.M. - Northville City Hall - City Council Chambers

#### 1. CALL TO ORDER:

Chair Johnson called the Historic District Commission meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL:

**Present:** Argenta, Field, Gudridtz, Hoffman, Johnson

**Absent:** Vernacchia, Luikart (excused)

**Also present:** Consultant Elmiger

3. PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

### 4. APPROVAL OF AGENDA:

**MOTION** Gudridtz, support by Argenta, to approve the agenda as presented. **Motion carried unanimously 5-0.** 

#### 5. APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS MEETING MINUTES:

**MOTION** Field, support by Gudridtz, to approve the minutes from the May 21, 2014 Historic District Commission meeting, as amended. **Motion carried unanimously 5-0**.

#### 6. REPORTS:

- A. **CITY ADMINISTRATION:** None.
- **B. CITY COUNCIL:** None.
- C. PLANNING COMMISSIONER. None.
- D. OTHER COMMUNITY/GOVERNMENTAL LIAISONS: None.

#### 7. CASES

CASE #1 JON & MICHELE HUTTO 333 N. ROGERS

### ADDITIONS AND GARAGE

Jon Hutto, 333 N. Rogers Street, Northville, MI 48187 was present on behalf of this application, which is to construct an addition on to the house at the above address, and a new garage that connects to the house with a breezeway. This request was originally presented to the Commission in 2009, and because of the economic recession, was not constructed. The original approvals expired, and therefore the applicant is presenting a new application for consideration.

The plans presented tonight are the same plans that were presented in 2009, with the exception of a few changes. They have broken up the roofline using metal standing seam roof material over the breezeway, the garage dormers and keeping room. They are also constructing the project in one phase instead of two. The plans originally submitted with this application show the conceptual plans approved in 2009, which caused some confusion. However, additional plans are being provided at tonight's meeting, which are the final construction plans. They are the final plans approved in 2009, which have been revised to show the entire project rather than just the first

phase. All of the informational items requested by the consultant's review (dated June 11, 2014) have been addressed on the plans submitted tonight.

Mr. Hutto reviewed the materials proposed for the project with the Commissioners. The windows, patio doors, door walls and front door are all Anderson 400 series. The siding will be James Hardy siding. The metal standing seam roof will be in "Hartford Green" color, which is similar to the existing green asphalt shingles on the original house, and that proposed for the other roof areas. The basement will not be finished at this time. The attic will also not be finished and will not be occupied. It will only be used for storage, and has a pull-down ladder for access.

Discussion followed. The Commissioners confirmed that since the original approvals have expired, this is considered a new application, and reviewed as such. The Commissioners discussed how the addition is differentiated from the original structure, and how this is a principle goal of modifying historic structures. The applicant stated that the new addition will have a brick foundation, while the original structure has a field stone foundation.

The Commissioners also discussed the relative size of the addition to the original structure, and whether it was appropriate to the existing home, the size of the lot, and with other homes in the neighborhood. They also discussed the breezeway, whether this structure actually created a 'de-facto' attached garage, and the impact it had to the massing of the addition. Also discussed was the proposal to replace the existing house's clapboard siding with Hardy board siding.

MOTION Hoffman, support by Field, to accept the application as complete. Motion carried unanimously 5-0.

**MOTION** Argenta, support by Hoffman, to grant a Notice to Proceed, referencing the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, in particular standards 9 and 10, and Northville Historic District Design Standards 3.14 setbacks, 3.16 mass, 3.17 height, 3.18 scale, 3.19 proportion, 3.20 hierarchy, 3.21 rhythm, 3.22 details, 3.23 decks and dormers, 3.24 garages, 5.4 masonry, 5.9 shingles, 5.10 metal roof, 5.14 windows, 5.17 siding and 5.18 paint and colors, with the express requirement that the siding on the existing structure be retained and maintained, and that it not be replaced without returning to the Historic District Commission first. **Motion carried 4-1 with Gudridtz opposed**.

#### 8. DISCUSSION – STRUCTURAL ENGINEER

Consultant Elmiger reported that she has contacted Sheppard Engineering, recommended by Commissioner Argenta, regarding providing on-call structural engineering evaluations for residential buildings (wood/timber structures) proposed for demolition. She stated that the firm was not interested in doing the work because of the potential liability involved, given the difficulty in seeing the structural members. Chair Johnson suggested she contact them again and confirm that is their opinion, since buildings slated for demolition would most likely not require coverings such as dry wall or siding be retained. Commissioner Argenta also agreed to discuss this with Ms. Elmiger, and possibly contact the firm.

Ms. Elmiger also provided follow up on the topic of Eastern Michigan University students conducting a survey of structures within the Historic District. She stated that EMU faculty recommended that this project is more appropriate for a one-year intern position, rather than making it part of a class or as a final project for one student. The cost of the intern would be approximately \$6,000, which is half of the student's tuition costs. She had spoken to the City Manager about this as well, who voiced concerns about being able to supervise an intern.

The Commissioners discussed the survey, and offered the suggestion to contact other universities to ascertain whether they may be interested in making the survey part of a class. They also suggested asking if the archivist at Mill Race Village if she may be able to work with and supervise an intern while they conducted the survey. Ms.

Elmiger said she would follow up with these suggestions, as well as contact a professional firm to obtain a quote for doing the work.

Commissioner Gudridtz commented that the garage demolition and remodeling approved by the HDC at 129 N. Wing has not been started. This approval was granted more than a year ago, and would now be expired.

Approved as submitted: 7/16/14

## 9. ADJOURN

As there was no further discussion, Chair Johnson adjourned the meeting at 8:25 p.m.

Respectfully submitted, Sally Elmiger Recording Secretary

3